

## Grandiose Narcissism in Identity Politics

BY

Edward Conduit

Stourbridge, UK



### Article History

Received : 17/06/2022

Accepted : 21/06/2022

Published : 23/06/2022

### Corresponding author:

Edward Conduit

### Abstract

Healthy self-esteem should be contrasted with pathological narcissism, both at individual and collective level. Recognition of nine signs of Grandiose Narcissism are required in DSM5 for the training of psychiatrists and clinical psychologists. The transcribed utterances of spokespersons for seven identities - Scots, Israeli, Black, British Asian Muslim, LGBT+, Disabled and Women - were searched for the nine signs. Identity groups may feel united against the wrongs of an oppressor, who were named as "Westminster", "antisemitic", "white racist", "Islamophobic" "straight", "neurotypical" and "misogynist". Grandiosity and Need for Admiration were fairly general across groups. Three groups thought they were Unique. One or two were preoccupied with Fantasies of Ideals, which are probably unachievable. Two identity groups exceed the threshold for narcissism. Replications are needed.

**Keywords:** Identity, Narcissism, Grandiose

## Introduction

Identity politics promote the esteem of members of a group by comparison with the wider society and against a presumed oppressor. The term identity politics is supposed to have been coined by the Combahee River Collective in 1977, who say " We are a collective of Black feminists . . . struggling against racial, sexual, heterosexual, and class oppression". Identity politics may now have displaced class politics, which were a major dividing line until the last few decades. The aristocratic land-owning class headed by the monarch in the Middle Ages came to be challenged by a class of traders and entrepreneurs. They were in turn challenged by a new urban working class during the industrial revolution. Now the working class is greatly reduced in numbers in the United Kingdom, with only about two million people reported as industrial workers (Office of National Statistics, 2021). The aristocratic class based on land ownership is now quite marginal, while the owners of capital remain influential.

Identity politics requires a psychological theory (or theories) of narcissism. The term comes from the Greek myth of the beautiful youth Narcissus who fell in love with his own reflection. It was borrowed by Sigmund Freud to describe excessive self-love. Degges-White (2021) gives helpful illustrations of the clinical profile. The cohesion of an identity group is usually against the attribution of some powerful force of higher status that maintains

group members in victim status. The existence of the oppressor can hardly be disputed as a description of slave-owners and slaves, but the notion that "domestic violence is caused by a perpetrator" or that "Scotland is under the heel of Westminster" need careful study in each identity group.

Group coherence against a threat from above may be understood through another psychological theory, coined by the group analyst W.R Bion (1998). He describes any group that meets to address a "task" as also having within it one of three "basic assumptions". The most important is "Fight or Flight" and the others are "Dependency" and "Pairing". Participation in a small group has some danger through yielding of control of the self to the collective but has the benefit that every member can feel "mirrored". Strictly speaking, Bion means only face-to-face "small" groups and basic assumptions operate most strongly at a size of seven members and start to fade beyond 15 members. If the group becomes too large, some contributions may not be heard, so rejection and anger are felt. The theories of Freud and Bion, and also anthropology, are *vestehende*, by contrast with the *erklärende* approaches usually used in psychological research. The first may allow empathic feelings, whereas the latter connects non-personal entities by statistics. Both approaches are needed here.

Healthy Narcissism may be operationally equated with Good Self Esteem. Such Self-Esteem will follow from a secure childhood sense of having been unconditionally loved by carers and freely-

given approval from others currently. In the Rosenberg 10-item Self Esteem scale, the components are: feeling worthy, at least equal; having good qualities (particular skills, intelligence or beauty, resilience); feeling successful (reverse: a failure); feeling satisfied with oneself (reverse: dissatisfied). Healthy narcissism will have a positive or neutral effect on the self-esteem of others. Destructive narcissism is likely to include attempts to reduce the worth of others. This gives us a fairly straightforward metric, which will be used below: statements that claim superior status for an identity may be considered narcissistic; statements implying equality, or those implying high self-esteem without comparison, may be considered healthy.

Collective narcissism measures for political science purposes have been adapted from individual measures. Hatemi and Fazeka (2018) assessed voters days before the 2016 U.S. presidential election. They found the Entitlement facet of narcissism was uniformly related to more conservative positions, whereas Exhibitionism was related to more liberal values. Overall, the left and right were equally narcissistic. Golec de Zavala (2019) made a nine-item collective narcissism measure for a systematic treatment of recent Polish politics. She showed that "greenwashing" policies are liked by collective narcissists. For example, a policy of planting forests is seen as "putting the country in a good light", even when the rate of tree-felling exceeds the rate of planting.

In the current research, spokespersons' transcribed utterances were treated as data. These are rather formal speeches with spontaneity well-suppressed. Recordings of unrehearsed speech offers a different potential data source, which was used by Holtzman, Vazire, and Mehl (2010). Their EAR recordings were of 30-second intervals blind to the subjects every 12.5 minutes for four consecutive days. Transcripts were scored for extraverted speech acts (talking, being in a group, socialising, friend words), disagreeable acts (arguing, swear words, anger words), non-attendance at class, and sexual words. They concluded that Narcissists do indeed behave in more extroverted and less agreeable ways than non-narcissists, skip class more and use more sexual language. Most of these metrics are not transferrable to published utterance data so were not used here.

There are clear hazards in the use of language in this paper. The attempt to represent the viewpoint of under-reported identities may be seen as pejorative by identities with good access to media. The overriding principle is that each group of adults should be allowed to seek affirmation for themselves while not reducing that of others. Article One of the universal declaration of human rights says "All human beings are born free and equal in dignity and rights". As this is formulated in terms of individual beings, the corollary is that the dignity and rights of collectives are in strict proportion to their numbers, so legal adults shall enjoy "universal and equal suffrage". Legal minors have choices made for them by their parents, at least about education, but their rights in law supersede those of parents in cases of conflict, and a foetus also has some rights. For some purposes, a collective is one "legal person". Within the European Union, Germany and Malta are equal in terms of the rotating presidency, but unequal by a factor of 200

in number of citizens. For the purposes of narcissism calculation, the worth of every adult in a collective must be treated as 1.0.

## Method

The first aim was to find criteria of collective narcissism that could be reliably used to score signs in published texts of spokespersons for identity groups. The signs used in this paper are the criteria for individual narcissism in the Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of the American Psychiatric Association, 5th revision (DSM 5). The additional DSM5 "four functions" (Identity, Self-direction, Empathy, Intimacy) were not used. A narcissistic sign in one of the transcribed utterances, as identified by this author who has clinical psychology training, is shown by the keyword in bold italic e.g. ***distrust***. A "?" means that half a point was assigned. The nine signs are:

1. Grandiose sense of self-importance
2. Preoccupation with fantasies of unlimited success, power, brilliance, beauty, or ideal love
3. Belief that he or she is special and unique and can only be understood by, or should associate with, other special or high-status people or institutions.
4. Need for excessive admiration
5. Sense of entitlement
6. Interpersonally exploitative behaviour
7. Lack of empathy
8. Envy of others or belief that others are envious of him or her
9. Demonstration of arrogant and haughty behaviours or attitudes.

The data sources were published utterances of spokespersons in their own websites, recordings of speeches at the UN, and retrievable broadcast television. Identities were chosen according to frequency of sympathetic interviews on broadcast radio or television in the UK. The seven that were chosen are not claimed to be representative or superior or inferior to other identities, but only as having fairly frequent media time. Affirmation by out-groups is the implicit goal of collective narcissism, so the time duration of uncontested speech by a spokesperson is a sign of narcissistic success. Next on the list would have been Northern Irish Unionists, Poles in the UK and South Asian Hindus

The second set of data points concern perceived relative worth, by comparison with the main reference group - white English non-manual (A-B-C1) heterosexual able-bodied males, rated 1.0. Note that the reference group excludes manual (C2-D-E) males. White male manual workers are considered in the second paper, on Vulnerable Narcissism. In two cases below there are hard criteria of relative worth: the value of a Scots vote and prisoner exchange ratio for Israelis, leading to self-worth greater than one. Access to employment and earnings status is a moderately hard sign. ONS data suggest that women in the three main service sectors are in greater numbers than men. Although the identity "Women" may include the self-attribution "fighting for equality", which implies a worth of less than 1.0, the data suggest a worth nearer 2.0. "Worth" might in the future be operationalised as approval by others, especially those with control of media. For the present, speaking

time on the BBC and independent TV networks is a soft sign. Identity-related language including slurs need a lexicological analytic method which is outside the focus of a political psychology method, so slurs have been reported in the third paper in this series.

## Data

Identities surveyed in this article are Scots, Israeli, Black, LGBT+, Disabled, UK Asian Muslim, Women.

## Scots

This is the endonym of those who wish to separate from the UK and return to an independent nation. "Scoti" was a Roman exonym for Dal Riata (Gaelic speaking, west). In the first millennium, there were two other Celtic groups north of the Tweed: Cymbrogi (Britons, Welsh-speaking, SW) and Cruithenach (Picts, NE), both absorbed by 1100 CE. The Germanic groups were Northumbrians (Inglis speaking, SE, 450CE onwards) and Norse, as Vikings after 800 CE and as settlers of the Hebrides and extreme north after 1000 CE. The Norse of Orkney and Shetland were incorporated into Scotland after 1470. Inglis speakers were subordinate to Gaels after losing a battle in 685, but Inglis/ Germanic culture steadily re-emerged. The ethnonym Scot was generally adopted by the Germanic peoples. Normans were Scandinavians who defended Northern France and received land in exchange and switched to speaking French. Some migrated to Scotland in 1155 and achieved aristocratic titles, including the de Brus family line which provided the king in 1314 (Conduit, 2016). The Union of Crowns occurred in 1603 and the Act of Union in 1707. In 2014 a referendum tested support for dissolving this union. The major task for an independent Scotland would be financial, though consideration of this hardly appears in statements of Scots identity. If it acquired its pro-rata share of the UK debt of £2,300 billion and then had to borrow more to fund its programme, its credit status would be worse than after the Darien disaster which motivated the act of union. If a new nation of Scotland struggled economically, two hidden identities might re-emerge a pan-Celtic identity in areas of Irish immigration (Glasgow and Dundee), who in 2014 voted most strongly against the union; and Faroese-style independence in the formerly Norse areas.

The oppressor is usually "Westminster"; an impersonal noun replaces the more usual phrase "the democratically-elected government of the UK." The prosperous white English comparator is quite ambiguous in 2022. The Sunday Times rich list is dominated by non-citizens and the "wealth of London" described by spokespersons for Scottish nationalism is often empty mansions kept as investments. Speeches of two leaders of the SNP were searched for the nine signs of narcissism. Alex Salmond in the Hugo Young lecture 25/01/12 frequently used the phrase:

"Scotland could be a beacon . . ." (*excessive need for admiration; fantasies?*).

Nicola Sturgeon (23/10/16) said: "Scotland must be an 'equal partner' in Brexit talks". As Scotland has 10% of the UK population, the universal adult suffrage principle would make a

Scot worth ten English people (*grandiose sense of self-importance; entitlement; arrogance?*).

Other signs were not strongly in evidence, so three signs and two possible signs are scored.

## Israeli

This word is used to mean citizen of the modern state of Israel. Its etymology is said to be first recorded in Egypt in 1200 BCE and in Genesis 32:29, supposedly the name given to Jacob. This ethnonym based on the modern state has less ambiguity than the word "Jew", which has three senses that are often incompatible: religion, genetics and economics. 65% of Israelis told Gallup (2015) that they were not religious believers and about half of UK citizens who declare themselves "Jewish" for the census are not affiliated to any synagogue. Most prime ministers of Israel before Naftali Bennett appear to have been non-believers. Genetically, Israelis are similar to other people in the Middle East, except that they have some Italian genes (Hammer et al, 2000). Economically Jews often acted as moneylenders at a time when usury was banned for Christians. Abram Leon (1943) argues that hostility to them occurred when Gentiles could not repay debts, e.g. the York pogrom of 1190.

Identity as "Israeli" is defined almost entirely by the *shoah*. The literal translation is "disaster", but this would be the same as *naqba*, coined by Palestinians in 1947. The classical Greek word "holocaust" had been revived in World War One to describe the burning of Greeks by Ottomans at Smyrna, and extended to Assyrian Christians and Armenians. Israel chose this word for *shoah*. Was this enormous Nazi atrocity unique? The Golden Horde may have killed 90% of the population of Iran. The similarities of Iranians, other Semites and Israelis as victims could promote feelings of empathy, but they do not (*uniqueness*).

Utterances found were from two prime ministers and this famous line from the Torah:

Deuteronomy 7:6: "For you are a people consecrated to Adonai your God; of all the peoples on earth Adonai your God chose you to be God's treasured people" (*uniqueness, entitlement*).

Benjamin Netanyahu (2009) said: "Iran is the greatest antisemite in history" (*entitlement, empathy*).

One objective measure of the value Israel puts on its citizens is prisoner swaps. Six IDF soldiers were released in 1983 in exchange for 4,700 Palestinians and Lebanese; 430 Palestinian and Lebanese for three bodies in 2004; Gilad Shalit in exchange for 1027 Palestinian prisoners in 2011. The implied relative value is that an Israeli is worth 100 Arabs. A single metric might be calculated via the relative worth of Palestinian Arabs in England, though this would be invidious. Israel claims something like equality with nations in Europe and North America, but minimal connection with its Semitic neighbours (*grandiosity, uniqueness, arrogance*).

A recent speech by Naftali Bennett at the United Nations was chosen as the next data source. Bennett (2021) says, [Israel is] "a lighthouse in a stormy sea, in the toughest neighbourhood on

Earth" (*admiration, uniqueness*). He gives several utterances that are other-centred, not self-centred: he uses the word "brother" a lot, quotes with gratitude his mother's advice and enthuses about healthy debate. Therefore Grandiosity, Entitlement or Arrogance were not detected.

The oppressor is now invariably antisemitism. The word Semite was coined in the linguistics department of Göttingen university in the 1770s to classify Aramaic, Arabic, Hebrew and some Ethiopian languages. Outside linguistics it is now only used by Israelis and their adversaries.

## "Black"

The density of melanosomes in the skin is the visible biological basis of this identity. Its antonym, white, refers in the UK to English and Scots genes derived from the 5th-century Anglo-Saxon migration and the much earlier Celtic migration from Iberia, plus various smaller gene pools including those tending to dark skin (Callaway, 2015). Then "white" extended to migrants to North America and Australasia. Unfortunately, there may not be an alternative simple adjective to describe people who are long-term UK residents or recent migrants. "Black" is much more diverse: genetic diversity within a small area of Nigeria is greater than that in the whole of Europe. Self-description as "black" is now highly chosen by in-groups and accepted by out-groups. The corresponding adjective in Spanish which gave rise to the N\* word is highly vilified.

The oppressor is usually white racism, sometimes slavery. The systemic oppression of the endonym "black" is of course a shared history of having been enslaved for most Caribbeans, Black Americans and Brazilians. However, some black-skinned people had slave traders as ancestors who sold slaves to Europeans. King Gezo of Dahomey said in the 1840s: "the slave trade is the ruling principle of my people. It is the source and the glory of their wealth ... the mother lulls the child to sleep with notes of triumph over an enemy reduced to slavery." Some Yoruba and Benin ethnicities were slave traders. Among the modern 215 million Nigerians, Yoruba are 21% and Igbo 20.5%. Igbo are counted sixth and Yoruba eighth in terms of frequency of being taken as slaves. (The Bakongo, Mandé and Gbe were the top three, but tended to be taken to Brazil.)

The group identity "Black Lives Matter" is inherently a demand for recognition (*admiration?*) The self-esteem statement is quite modest, much less than "equality", so entitlement and exploitative features are absent. BLM coalesced around one external task, to achieve fair treatment by police and courts, particularly in relation to the death of George Floyd. As Lloyd's of London and several large corporations have now reluctantly declared they will compensate the victims of slavery, this would be a good time for Bakongo, Mandé or Igbo to be demanding resources for their ancestral communities in Africa and emigrés elsewhere.

Prominent BLM spokespersons in the USA include Alicia Garza (2020) who says: "Leadership today doesn't look like Martin Luther King' Our aspiration should not be to have a million followers on Twitter" . . . "We shouldn't be focused on building a

brand but building a base, and building the kind of movement that can succeed." Narcissism rating: ½.

## "LGBT+ . . ."

Men and women attracted to the same (*homo* in Greek) sex formed a powerful shared identity in the later 20th century, though without merging the two main endonyms - lesbian and gay. Bisexual (B) was added, sometimes Queer (Q), but usually "+". Then people with intermediate or transitional biological sex included themselves, so Trans (T) was appended.

LGBT+ identity has need for admiration as central (*Admiration*): many gay people work in entertainment and high visibility events such as Gay Pride achieve wide recognition. BritishLgbtwards (2021) celebrates LGBT+ people who have used their online presence to speak out. Some prominent gay people stand out for multiple identities. Jessica Kellgren-Fozard is lesbian, has disabilities (hearing impaired two chronic illnesses) and was judged influencer of 2021. Phyllis Akua Opoku-Gyimah received the lifetime achievement award and also represents a black pride identity. The gay scene might be seen as an analogue of the Paralympics - a novel arena which enhances self-esteem of its members, without much unhealthy narcissism (*entitlement?*) or detraction from the esteem of the 90% heterosexuals.

Pride events are now a well-established feature of LGBT+ life. The principle of "if you've got it, flaunt it" applies, and these might mean good looks, expensive garments, or verbal skills. Public performance can enhance the self-esteem of both performer and audience. However, pride is defined by Wiktionary as "an unreasonable overestimation of one's own superiority in terms of talents, looks, wealth, importance etc., which manifests itself in lofty airs, distance, reserve and often contempt of others . . . A sense of one's own worth, and scorn for what is beneath or unworthy of oneself; lofty self-respect; noble self-esteem; elevation of character; dignified bearing; rejection of shame. . . Proud or disdainful behaviour or treatment; insolence or arrogance of demeanour; haughty bearing and conduct; insolent exultation. Synonyms: disdain, hubris." The number of unsuccessful heterosexuals has increased sharply in the last few years. Ueda and Mercer (2019) found 26% of US men were sexually inexperienced.

A possible LGBT detraction from straight self-esteem should be considered in relation to the historically-valued identities of "married person" and "parent". Same-sex marriage was made legal in 2014 after homosexual acts had been decriminalised in 1967 in the UK. Curiously the words "husband" and "wife" have now reverted towards their Old English roots: *hus bondi* in OE meant the owner of house and *husbandman* meant a farmer of intermediate rank in ME; in OE *wif* was neuter and *wifman* masculine. The "Marriage (Same Sex Couples) Act: A factsheet" is appropriately enthusiastic about the importance of love between adults, but makes no mention of child-rearing. The Children's Act had previously given family courts greater responsibility for children than biological parents. The Child Support Agency has the power to pursue biological fathers for money, without affirming their worth. So the reduced scope of the word "marriage", and reduction of the approbative aspect of the words "parent" and

"father" may have negatively affected the straight community. This has hardly been researched.

The oppressor for LGBT+ people is usually homophobia; straight society is sometimes still used. "Homophobia" in Greek means "fear of the same sex". It used to refer to heterosexual fear of penetration, including anal rape in prison or the navy. In Freudian terms, it refers to the usual resolution of the Oedipus Complex by heterosexual identity. Its recent use as "unreasonable dislike" is therefore paradoxical and may reflect some lack of empathy for straight fear (*empathy?*).

## "Persons with a disability"

A person who is impaired by a lower limb amputation but has a good prosthesis may have an only slight disability (usually stump discomfort) and have no handicap in social role at all. Wolfensberger's separation of these three words and the history of slurs is discussed in more depth in part three of this research. Athletes with blades after amputation may actually have a slight advantage over able-bodied people. Overcoming disability to prevent social handicap may require resources, such as a team of carers for a wheelchair user, or a signer for a person with profound deafness such as Rose Ayling-Ellis. This woman with profound deafness was able to win the final in the TV programme *Strictly Come Dancing*.

Paralympic sport has greatly improved the identity of people with disabilities. It appears to have created a new arena for affirmation, probably without diminishing the status of able-bodied Olympic athletes. This contrasts with most other identity movements which have to compete for the same affirmative space on broadcast media. There some costs to able-bodied people. Disability commands substantial financial resources, the biggest being settlements for £10 - £20 million to a baby born with brain damage. Carers may suffer: as a clinical psychologist in 2015 I had three clients, each traumatised and unable to continue care work; one had been rammed by a wheelchair user, another had been pushed downstairs by a person with learning difficulties, and the third had been punched hard by a nine-year-old.

Autism is one impairment of mental function that is now seen as partially positive. It was described by Euler in 1911 as rare, perhaps 4.5 per 10,000 people, and involving severe mental impairment. The term now includes as many as one in 57 people. The capacity for intense concentration and exclusion of social cues is now seen as sometimes advantageous, for example for employment in software proofing. Intense thinkers, including Darwin, Einstein, Paul Dirac and James Joyce have been suggested as autistic. The naturalist Chris Packham is now well-known as a TV presenter with wide wildlife knowledge and Asperger's Syndrome.

The sense of oppression by people with disabilities is probably now quite low, though the usual question of internalisation of the oppressor's values arises. The reporter Rosie Jones, who has ataxic cerebral palsy, speaks of "Overcoming Internalised Ableism". The TV programme *The Last Leg* has been broadcast since the first Paralympics. Although its presenter Adam Hill works hard to

empathise with disabled perspectives, he created a narrative around one Wembley football event. A disabled person was, bizarrely, "kidnapped" by footballers in an attempt to gain entry to the pitch. The desperation of football supporters will be considered later; there may be some lack of *empathy?*

The very complex banding system for impairments will inevitably create some perceptions of unfairness, though these are not obvious to the TV viewer. The International Olympic Committee's struggle to prevent advantage to women with naturally high testosterone has been much more visible.

## "British Asian Muslim"

The UK census (2021) offers "British Asian" as a self-definition. Among the three million UK residents declaring themselves Muslim, 38% give their country of origin as Pakistan. There also Hindus and Sikhs. The representatives of this identity chosen here were therefore a spokesperson for the Muslim Council of Britain, the Prime Minister of Pakistan and Salman Rushdie. The last is of Kashmiri Muslim heritage, born in Bombay and British-American, and has published widely-distributed novels about Pakistan. Within the ethnonym Pakistani the ethnolinguistic groups Mirpuri and Punjabi are the most numerous. The next biggest group within UK Islam (14%) claim Bangladesh as their country of origin, speak Bangla and have forebears who were East Pakistani until 1971.

The Pakistan-Bangladesh conflict needs special consideration as it illustrates very well the narcissistic features of ethnic identity. Salman Rushdie's 1981 novel "Midnight's Children" has been voted the best ever Booker prize winner. It is told as the personal voyage of the principal character Saleem, born within seconds of India's independence and one of some hundreds possessing special powers. Memories of the war between West Pakistan and East Pakistan in 1971 would be suppressed were it not for this novel: it involved huge loss of life, conflict between two ethnolinguistic groups, both mainly Sunni Muslim, and rape as a political tool. East Pakistan had voted for the Awami League, but General Yahya launched Operation Searchlight by flying Pakistani soldiers in plain clothes on civilian flights over India to seize weapons arsenals. Yahya Khan said, "*Pehle inko Mussalman karo*" ('first, make them Muslim') to justify collective rape and impregnation of Bengali Hindus (*exploitativeness, arrogance, entitlement*). The war, with intervention by India, resulted in Bangladeshi independence. Although persons of Pakistani heritage feel themselves the victims of racism in the UK, their forebears 50 years ago considered themselves racially superior to Bengalis. This is reflected in the relative worth score of 3.0 in the summary table.

The current Prime Minister of Pakistan is Imran Khan, who addressed the UN (24 Sep 21).

A text search for victim phrases found these: "Islamophobia is a pernicious phenomenon that must be combatted collectively", "we are a victim of COVID", "a post-9/11 tendency for xenophobic and violent nationalists, as well as extremists and terrorist groups to target Muslims", "gross and systematic violations of human rights by . . . fascist India", "Pakistan blamed for the turn of events by

politicians in the US", "plunder of the developing world by their corrupt elites", "among the 10 most vulnerable nations to the effects of climate change". A text search for "friend", "partner", "brother" "equal" found no hits. One hit each were found for "ally" and "oneness of humanity". The second is a near-synonym for "ummah", the union of all mankind in submission to God, which in principle all Muslims believe, though it is ambiguous here (*fantasies of perfection?*) This speech is a strong statement of identity as a victim. The narcissistic traits *empathy (lack of), entitlement, arrogance* are scorable. The vulnerable trait *shame* (high FFM self-consciousness) is also present. Seven signs and two possible signs are scored here.

The oppressor in this speech and for the MCB is "Islamophobia"; elsewhere "white racism" is sometimes attributed. A discussion of the words "Pakistan" and "Zimbo" is found in part three, "slurs".

**"Women"**

Women's groups have a very high media presence and the requirement of balance is rarely achieved. The victim status of a "male-dominated workplace" is rather contradicted by the data of the Office of National statistics (2021): women dominate all professions (except engineering) and the three biggest spheres of employment - health, education and care, with four million people in each. Women's groups show much greater attention to the feelings and self-worth of their members than any other identity so the question arises: to what extent is this *grandiose narcissism?* The main oppressor word for most women's groups since 2019 is "misogynism", discussed further in the section on "slurs".

Nicole Kidman (2021) said, "As the Goodwill Ambassador of UN Women, the United Nations' organization working to empower women and girls, I have seen that there is no limit (*fantasy, of unlimited success*) to what women can achieve when given the opportunity. Working with UN Women, I have met women who had to overcome enormous obstacles, yet who went on to help others and organize to achieve social change. To me, these women embody resilience, strength, dignity—and hope." (*admiration; empathy and envy are not present*).

"End violence against women and girls" is the name of an influential campaign group. This is the area where the victim-perpetrator attribution clashes hard with the science. Professor Irene Frieze (2008) states again her 1992 finding that women are more likely to initiate domestic violence than their male partners. A meta-analysis of 82 studies by Archer (2002) found that women

report being more violent than their male partners. It has very high affirmation by the UK government (VAWG,2022), which makes no mention of the Frieze and Archer findings. VAWG's refusal to consider that women can be violent might be considered *grandiosity, need for admiration*. Their exclusion of boys might be considered sexist.

Gillian Guy of the Citizens Advice Bureau was instrumental in getting a "Coercion" Act made law in 2015. Her evidence was entirely about males trying to restrict the spending of their female partners, which she dubbed "financial abuse". No relevant prosecutions have followed, as was reasonably foreseeable. Was she acting on *entitlement* and *lacking empathy?* "Coercion" is discussed as a possible "sexist transitive verb" in Conduit (2020).

Caroline Criado-Perez received the Royal Society 2019 Insight Investment Committee's book prize for "Invisible Women". Her promotion of that book used the advertising hook line "women find themselves in a world designed by men for themselves". She proceeds to adduce instances where women suffer as a result. Inspection of the evidence base behind several dozen propositions has yet to find one which has survived experimental refutation. "Women's heart attacks are different", "because physicians are untrained in the special needs (*uniqueness*) of women" was refuted by a concurrent scientific journal publication (Ferry, 2019). A study in an Edinburgh hospital compared presenting symptoms at triage with later confirmation of MI by a Troponin test, which is evidence of broken-down heart muscle in the bloodstream. This research found that only crushing pain had predictive value. The other symptoms are likely to be features of anxiety, especially when the diagnosis is given. The British Heart Foundation (2019) concludes: "incorrectly assuming that women having a heart attack suffer different symptoms to men could lead to misdiagnosis, delayed treatment and less intensive medical interventions . . . and could have contributed to at least 8,200 avoidable deaths in England and Wales in the last decade". Criado-Perez also encourages women to volunteer for drug trials, ignoring the FDA's reason for excluding women of child-bearing age - Thalidomide. Signs: *grandiosity, fantasies of brilliance, need for admiration, sense of entitlement, lack of empathy*.

Here is a hypothesis which could be tested elsewhere: "Invisible Women contains no scientific propositions". If scientific peer review of the first 100 propositions found that six had survived refutation, the hypothesis would be refuted at the 5% confidence level.

**Results**

Table 1 summarises findings for narcissism in seven identities.

	Scots	Israeli	Black	LGBT+	Disabled	UK Asian Muslim	Women
Grandiosity	Y	Y	N	N	N	Y	Y
Fantasies	?	N	N	N	N	?	Y
Uniqueness	N	Y	N	N	N	Y	Y

Admiration	Y	Y	N	Y	N	?	Y
Entitlement	Y	?	N	?	N	Y	?
Exploitativeness	N	N	N	N	N	Y	Y
Empathy	N	N	N	?	?	Y	Y
Envy	N	N	?	N	N	Y	?
Arrogance	?	N	N	N	N	Y	Y
Total Narcissism (/9)	4	3½	½	2	½	8	8

Table 2 Approval and Victim-Perpetrator status of seven identities

“Approval” is visibility, audibility and empathic reporting and status equal to or higher than comparators on broadcast TV. It might be thought as like Gallup’s approval rating, a percentage determined by polling which indicates the percentage of respondents to an opinion poll who approve of a particular person or programme. The rating is only “high”, “medium” or “low” until better inter-rater agreement can be achieved.

“Oppressor” below means the most frequently-cited more powerful external force that maintains low approval of the identity group. Victim status below is reasonably self-explanatory, while “perpetrator” status refers to that identity group’s reduction of the approval of one or more out-groups. “Discourse denial” refers to low dissemination of extended narrative for that. “Out group discourse denying” means that an out group’s narrative is prevented from dissemination by discrediting, slurs or depersonalisation. The “relative worth” is the approval implied by some identity group’s statements of their status in relation to the presumed comparator –English, white, heterosexual, able-bodied, irreligious or Anglican, male.

	Scots	Israeli	Black	LGBT+	Disabled	UK Asian Muslim	Women
Oppressor	Westminster	antisemitism	white racism slavery	straight society	ableism	Islamophobia, white racism	misogyny
Victim status historical	Med	Hi	Hi	Hi	Hi	Med	Med
Victim status current	Lo	Lo	Med	Med	Lo	Med	Lo
Own discourse denied	Lo	Lo	Med	Med	Med	Med	Hi
Perpetrator status	Lo	Hi	Lo	Lo	Med	Hi	Hi
Out group discourse denying	Lo	Hi Discredit	Lo	Med	Lo	Hi Slurs	Hi Depers
Relative worth	2 - 10	1.0 - 50	0.5	0.7 – 1.3	0.9	0.9 - 3.0	0.9 - 2.0

**Discussion**

The data from seven identities allow differentiation of healthy self-esteem from narcissism that reduces the esteem of others. The reliability (inter-rater and test-retest) of single signs in psychiatry is

generally low. Reliability improves for differential diagnosis between a few categories. Inter-rater reliability of the entries in the table needs disconfirmation by further research. The Approval, Victim-Perpetrator status and Relative Worth judgments were rated

on a 3-point scale only in anticipation of improved reliability in future research.

The Disabled identity seems to have the lowest narcissistic impacts on others. Normalised language and the Paralympics have made major contributions. Black identity also has a low adverse impact on others, it is only mildly envious of colonialist images, its self-statement is very modest and its goal of better justice is limited. The LGBT+ identity also seems to have relatively few adverse effects on others, though the esteem of parents may have been incidentally reduced by the narrowed definition of marriage. The two identities associated with a nation-state both seem to value their members more highly than out-groups and both Scots and Israelis want to be admired as "a beacon", but only Israelis stress their uniqueness. Two identities score more than five out of nine signs of collective narcissism. The sign "preoccupation with fantasies of unlimited success, power, brilliance, beauty, or ideal love" was unexpectedly detected. It implies idealisation which in child psychoanalysis is seen as nostalgic longing for the glorious symbiotic union between mother and baby. Sadly for all of us, it is never regained.

## Conclusion

The evidence about seven political identities suggests that legitimate demands for recognition often contain a small element of narcissism, but two exceeded the threshold for pathological narcissism. Each of the findings here needs replication.

It is recognised that any article that discusses narcissism will include phrases that may be taken as causes for offence. If so, the objector should be mindful that "all human beings are born free and equal in dignity and rights" and strive to affirm each adversary.

## References

1. Archer, J. (2000). Sex differences in aggression between heterosexual partners: A meta-analytic review. *Psychological Bulletin* 126, 651–680. <https://doi.apa.org/doiLanding?doi=10.1037%2F0033-2909.126.5.651>
2. Bennett, Naftali (21 Sep 21). Speech at the United Nations. <https://www.c-span.org/video/?514743-1/israeli-prime-minister-addresses-un-general-assembly>
3. Bion, W.R. (1961, 1998). *Experiences in Groups*. Paperback. Routledge.
4. Britishlgbtawards(2021)<https://britishlgbtawards.com/top-10-online-influencers-2021>
5. Callaway, E (2015). UK mapped out by genetic ancestry. <https://www.nature.com/articles/nature.2015.17136>
6. Combahee River Collective(1977) <https://combaheerivercollective.weebly.com/>
7. Community Security Trust. <https://cst.org.uk/research/prosecutions-for-antisemitism>
8. Conduit, E. (2016). *Bannockburn: Norman v Norman*. Laghamon Publishing paperback and <https://www.smashwords.com/books/view/667886>
9. Conduit, E. (2020). The sexism of transitive verbs. *International Journal of Law, Language & Discourse*. Volume 8, Issue 1. <https://www.ijld.com/807/volume-8/8-1-conduit/>
10. Criado Perez, C. (7 Mar 2019). *Invisible Women: Exposing Data Bias in a World Designed for Men*. Chatto & Windus; Kindle.
11. Degges-White, S. (2021). The 13 Traits of a Narcissist. <https://www.psychologytoday.com/gb/blog/lifetime-connections/202110/the-13-traits-narcissist>
12. Ueda and Mercer (2019) Trends in Frequency of Sexual Activity and Number of Sexual Partners Among Adults Aged 18 to 44 Years in the US, 2000-2018. [DOI:10.1001/jamanetworkopen.2020.3833](https://doi.org/10.1001/jamanetworkopen.2020.3833)
13. Ferry, A. et al (2019). Presenting Symptoms in Men and Women Diagnosed with Myocardial Infarction Using Sex-Specific Criteria. *J Am Heart Association*. 2019;8:e012307. <https://doi.org/10.1161/JAHA.119.012307>
14. Frieze, I. (2008). Social policy, feminism, and research on violence in close relationships. *Journal of Social Issues* 64(3), 665-684. <https://spssi.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1540-4560.2008.00583.x>
15. Gallup (2015) <https://www.haaretz.com/israel-china-among-least-religious-nations-1.5350737>
16. Garza, Alicia (2020). <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2020/oct/17/black-lives-matter-alicia-garza-leadership-today-doesnt-look-like-martin-luther-king>
17. Golec de Zavala, A., Dyduch-Hazar, Dorottya Lantos (20 March 2019) Collective Narcissism: Political Consequences of Investing Self-Worth in the Ingroup's Image <https://doi.org/10.1111/pops.12569>
18. Hammer, MF et al (2000). Jewish and Middle Eastern non-Jewish populations share a common pool of Y-chromosome biallelic haplotypes. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC18733/>
19. Hatemi, Peter K., Fazekas, Zoltán Narcissism and Political Orientations. *American Journal of Political Science*, Oct 2018, 62 (4) pp 873-888. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ajps.12380>
20. Holtzman, NS. Vazire, S and Mehl, MR Sounds like a Narcissist: Behavioral Manifestations of Narcissism in Everyday Life. *J Res Pers*. 2010 Aug 1; 44(4): 478–484. <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/20711512/>
21. Kohut, H (2013) *The Analysis of the Self: A Systematic Approach to the Psychoanalytic Treatment of Narcissistic Personality Disorders*. Kindle Book and <https://b-ok.cc/reader/2722031>
22. Khan, Imran (24 Sep 21) speech to the UN. <https://arynews.tv/pm-imran-unga-speech-76-session>
23. Leon, Abram (1943) *The Jewish Question: A Marxist Interpretation*. Pathfinder <https://www.marxists.org/subject/jewish/leon/>
24. Marriage (Same-Sex Couples) Act: A factsheet. <https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uplo>

- [ads/system/uploads/attachment\\_data/file/306000/140423\\_M\\_SSC\\_Act\\_factsheet\\_web\\_version.pdf](https://www.norton.com/college/psych/psychsci/media/rosenberg.htm)
25. Muslim Council of Britain (17 Nov 21) <https://mcb.org.uk/community/azeem-rafiq-dcms-testimony-challenging-institutional-racism-in-britain-today/>
26. Office of National Statistics Annual Population Survey - Occupation by sex, employment status and full/part-time. <https://www.nomisweb.co.uk/datasets/aps210/reports/employment-by-status-and-occupation?>
27. Rosenberg Self Esteem Scale. <https://www.norton.com/college/psych/psychsci/media/rosenberg.htm>
28. Rushdie, Salman (1981). *Midnight's Children*. Vintage Classics and Kindle.
29. The Last Leg (27 Sept 2021) Youtube videos, including Rosie Jones speaking of "Overcoming Internalised Ableism" <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ux8EogwHnY>
30. UK census (2021) <https://www.gov.uk/government/statistics/announcements/initial-findings-from-the-2021-census-in-england-and-wales>
31. Universal declaration of human rights. <https://www.un.org/en/about-us/universal-declaration-of-human-rights>
32. VAWG(2022) <https://www.gov.uk/government/consultations/violence-against-women-and-girls-vawg-call-for-evidence/violence-against-women-and-girls-vawg-strategy-2021-2024-call-for-evidence>